

SHEILA WIRKUS PENDERGAST (SBN 251562)

HENNELLY & GROSSFELD LLP

4640 Admiralty Way, Suite 850
Marina del Rey, California 90292

Telephone: (310) 305-2100

Facsimile: (310) 305-2116

Email: mking@hgla.com

Email: spendergast@hgla.com

PHILLIP M. GIORDANO (Mass. Bar Number 193530)
(Pro Hac Vice)

Siobhan M. Tolan (Mass. Bar Number 687101)
(Pro Hac Vice)

**Giordano & Company, P.C.
REED & GIORDANO, P.A.**

47 Winter Street, Suite 800
Boston, MA 02108-4706

Tel: (617) 723-7755

Fax: (617) 723-7756

Email: pgiordano@reedgiordano.com

Email: stolan@reedgiordano.com

Attorneys for Defendant

Michelle Faherty d/b/a MRF Associates, Inc.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

Crafty Productions, Inc., a California
corporation, and CPI Productions, LLC,
a California company,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

Fuqing Sanxing Crafts Co. Ltd., a
China company, Tony Zhu, an
individual, Michelle Faherty d/b/a
MRF Associates, an individual, The
Michaels Companies, Inc., a Delaware
corporation, Michaels Stores, Inc., a
Delaware corporation, Plaid
Enterprises, Inc., a Georgia
corporation, Hobby Lobby Stores,
Inc., an Oklahoma corporation, Sbars,
Inc., a New Jersey corporation, A.C.
Moore Arts & Crafts, Inc., a New
Jersey corporation, 99 Cents Only
Stores LLC, a California company,
Dollar Tree Stores, Inc., a Virginia

Case No. 15-cv-00719-BAS-JLB

Assigned to: Hon. Cynthia Bashant
Courtroom No.: 4B 4th Floor

**DEFENDANT MICHELLE
FAHERTY d/b/a MRF
ASSOCIATES, INC.'S
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS'
EX PARTE APPLICATION
REQUESTING ORAL
ARGUMENT ON PENDING
MOTIONS**

(ECF 84-85 88-90 103-104)

Hearing: November 23, 2015

**NO ORAL ARGUMENT UNLESS
REQUESTED BY THE COURT**

corporation, Jo-Ann Stores, LLC, an Ohio company, Party City Holdings, Inc., a Delaware corporation, Party City Corporation, a Delaware corporation, ZheJiang HongYe Co. Ltd., a China company, Fuzhou Bomy Trading Co., Ltd., a China company, Fuzhou Great Suns Co. Ltd., a China company, Sunface Crafts Co. Ltd., a China company,

Complaint Filed: April 1, 2015
First Amended Complaint Filed: September 11, 2015
Trial Date: None

Defendants.

Defendant Michelle Faherty, d/b/a MRF Associates, Inc., ("Faherty") opposes Plaintiffs' Ex Parte Application, D.I. 134, requesting oral argument on the pending motions calendared for November 23, 2015.

Defendant Faherty respectfully disagrees that, at least with respect to Defendant Faherty's Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction any of the reasons identified by Plaintiffs support the need for oral argument. The declarations supporting Faherty's Motion confirm that Faherty lacks the requisite minimum contacts and Plaintiffs have not presented any relevant evidence that contradicts that finding.

Defendant Faherty also objects to any attempt by the Plaintiffs to introduce testimony by Ms. Paula Mello at the requested hearing. Ms. Mello has offered testimony through her declaration in support of Plaintiffs' opposition to the numerous Defendants' motions. It seems that the Plaintiffs are trying to supplement their papers by trying to seize the opportunity to offer live testimony in their request for oral argument. Plaintiffs had ample time to offer evidence and Ms. Mello's testimony through declaration to support their papers. Both sides had the opportunity

1 to present the best evidence through their respective papers. An oral argument is not
2 required.

3
4
5 Dated: November 19, 2015

REED & GIORDANO, P.A.

7
8 By: /s/ Philip M. Giordano
9 Philip M. Giordano (Pro Hac Vice)
10 Siobhan M. Tolan (Pro Hac Vice)
11 Attorney for Defendant
12 Michelle Faherty d/b/a MRF
13 Associates, Inc.

14 Dated: November 19, 2015

HENNELLY & GROSSFELD LLP

15
16 By: /s/ Michael G. King
17 Michael G. King
18 Sheila Wirkus Pendergast
19 Attorneys for Defendant
20 Michelle Faherty d/b/a MRF
21 Associates, Inc.
22 E-mail: mking@hgla.com
23 E-mail: spendergast@hgla.com
24
25
26
27
28

HENNELLY & GROSSFELD, LLP
4640 ADMIRALTY WAY, SUITE 850
MARINA DEL REY, CA 90292
(310) 305-2100

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Philip M. Giordano hereby certify that on this 19th day of November, 2015, I filed the foregoing using the CM/ECF system, which caused the foregoing to be served to all parties, by and through their counsel of record, on an electronic basis.

Executed on November 19, 2015, at Boston, Massachusetts

/s/ Philip M. Giordano